

# Attachment A

**Phoenix City Council  
Public Safety and Justice (PSJ) Subcommittee  
Summary Minutes  
Wednesday, June 8, 2022**

City Council Chambers  
200 W. Jefferson St.  
Phoenix, Ariz.

Subcommittee Members Present Subcommittee Members Absent

Councilwoman Ann O'Brien, Chair  
Councilman Jim Waring  
Councilwoman Yassamin Ansari  
Councilmember Carlos Garcia

Councilmember Carlos Garcia joined the voting body at 9:36 a.m.

**CALL TO ORDER**

Chairwoman O'Brien called the Public Safety and Justice Subcommittee to order at 9:32 a.m. with Councilman Jim Waring and Councilwoman Yassamin Ansari present. She thanked the Phoenix Police Officers that had received recognition during National Police Week and the Pride in Our Heroes Annual Awards Ceremony. She described the historical marker monument ceremony to honor fallen Phoenix Police Officer Ginarro New and the homecoming of wounded Police Officer Tyler Moldovan. She expressed her commitment to supporting public safety in the City.

**CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Jacob Raiford expressed concerns about the Police Department and voiced support for non-Police responses to various call types.

**MINUTES OF MEETINGS**

**1. Minutes of the Public Safety and Justice Subcommittee Meeting**

Councilwoman Ansari made a motion to approve the minutes of the May 11, 2022 Public Safety and Justice Subcommittee meeting. Councilman Waring seconded the motion, which passed unanimously 4-0.

**INFORMATION ONLY (ITEMS 2-3)**

**2. Phoenix Police Department Hiring, Recruitment, and Attrition Monthly Report**

Councilman Waring asked for an update on hiring efforts.

Assistant City Manager Lori Bays introduced Executive Assistant Police Chief Michael Kurtenbach.

Councilman Waring stated his understanding of police hiring efforts and asked if hiring trends were continuing to improve.

Chief Kurtenbach described recent accomplishments in police hiring.

Councilman Waring asked for an estimate of police staffing levels in December if current trends continued.

Chief Kurtenbach discussed expected changes to police staffing levels and response times based on current trends.

Councilman Waring stated his understanding of police staffing trends.

Chief Kurtenbach confirmed that this was accurate.

Councilman Waring asked how staffing levels impacted response times.

Chief Kurtenbach described current Police Department resource allocation strategies to meet community needs and improve response times.

Councilman Waring recognized efforts to improve staffing levels and response times.

**3. Continued Item Going to June 15, 2022 Formal Council Meeting – Neighborhood Block Watch Oversight Committee’s Recommendations for the 2022 Grant Program Awards**

Information only. No Councilmember requested additional information.

**INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION (ITEMS 4-5)**

**4. City of Phoenix and Arizona State University Police Response to Calls-for-Service Project**

Assistant City Manager Lori Bays introduced the item and presenters.

Dr. Michael Scott of Arizona State University described the purpose, guiding principles, and various analytical considerations of the Calls-for-Service Project. He discussed alternatives to sworn police response to identified call types and the importance of timely police response to emergencies and proactive community problem solving. He explained preliminary recommendations of the project and emphasized the shared responsibility among stakeholder groups to address community challenges.

Councilman Waring asked how self-reported vehicle crashes might impact insurance reporting.

Dr. Scott noted that insurance claims should not be impacted by a change in vehicle crash reporting processes.

Councilman Waring indicated that self-reporting could lead to difficulties determining the responsible party in vehicle crashes.

Chief Kurtenbach explained that Arizona state law required that vehicle crash reports be filed by a member of the Police Department.

Councilman Waring stated his understanding that City could not pursue self-reporting of vehicle crashes.

Chief Kurtenbach noted that the City could not pursue this under Arizona state law.

Councilman Waring indicated that this information should have been included in the presentation and asked why this was a recommended course of action.

Chairwoman O'Brien noted that Dr. Scott had mentioned that some recommendations would be dependent on state and local laws. She asked staff to explain which recommendations could not be implemented under current laws.

Chief Kurtenbach described existing laws and program details related to intrusion alarms, abandoned vehicles, and noise complaints.

Chairwoman O'Brien indicated that the police response to vehicle crashes was guided by state statute.

Chief Kurtenbach confirmed this was correct.

Dr. Scott explained that some law enforcement agencies in Arizona had been able to reduce their vehicle crash investigations, encouraging further exploration by City staff.

Councilwoman Ansari thanked the presenters and asked about plans to implement proposed recommendations.

Ms. Bays noted that next steps for the Calls-for-Service Project would be discussed later in the presentation.

Councilman Waring asked about the potential to utilize Police Assistants to respond to vehicle crashes.

Chief Kurtenbach indicated that Police Assistants were already utilized to respond to some vehicle crashes.

Councilman Waring asked if there was a mix of both Police Assistants and Police Officers responding to minor vehicle crashes.

Chief Kurtenbach confirmed that there was.

Councilman Waring suggested that the City could hire additional Police Assistants to respond to minor crashes. He asked how many additional Police Assistants would be needed to eliminate sworn officer responses to minor crashes.

Chief Kurtenbach noted that staff was working with Ms. Bays to explore this.

Councilman Waring expressed concern about utilizing non-sworn staff to respond to civil matter stand-by requests. He indicated his openness to exploring reduced sworn officer welfare checks. He emphasized the prevalence of noise complaints and asked about civil cost recovery.

Chief Kurtenbach asked for clarification on Councilman Waring's question.

Councilman Waring clarified that he would like more information on how noise complaints were impacted by short-term rentals.

Chief Kurtenbach discussed revenues and costs related to noise complaints.

Councilman Waring voiced concerns about the adequacy about a non-sworn response to the rising number of noise complaints. He asked about the cost recovery of the sworn officer response to intrusion alarms.

Chief Kurtenbach indicated that the intrusion alarm program was almost cost neutral.

Councilman Waring stated his understanding of the intrusion alarm program.

Chief Kurtenbach confirmed Councilman Waring's understanding.

Councilman Waring suggested that non-sworn staff could be hired to respond to intrusion alarms instead of assigned sworn staff.

Chief Kurtenbach explained that the only staff assigned to the intrusion alarm program were civilian staff, noting that these staff could be reassigned to meet other police needs if related laws and program policies were changed.

Councilman Waring expressed confusion about the intrusion alarm program and how recommended changes would impact staffing levels.

Chief Kurtenbach reiterated that the budgeted intrusion alarm staff were non-sworn staff managing the program.

Councilman Waring asked for confirmation that the non-sworn staff intrusion alarm would not respond to violent crimes if not assigned to the intrusion alarm program.

Chief Kurtenbach confirmed that the non-sworn intrusion alarm staff would not respond to violent crimes.

Councilman Waring indicated that the intrusion alarm program was revenue positive.

Chief Kurtenbach verified this. He clarified that the recommendation was to eliminate police response to intrusion alarms and defer this response to alarm companies.

Councilman Waring noted that the revenues provided by the program would not cover the costs of sworn officer responses to intrusion alarms. He described the potential impacts of implementing the recommended policy change. He stated his understanding of the police response to abandoned vehicles and asked for more information on the abandoned vehicle program.

Chief Kurtenbach explained the police response to abandoned vehicles, highlighting the potential staff involved at different stages in the process.

Councilman Waring asked if the staff signing documentation for the towing contractor must be sworn staff.

Chief Kurtenbach indicated this did not need to be done by a sworn officer.

Councilman Waring described a recent experience calling the police about an abandoned vehicle and suggested non-sworn staff respond to abandoned vehicle call.

Chief Kurtenbach agreed with this suggestion.

Councilman Waring noted that non-sworn staff could also be utilized for parking enforcement.

Councilmember Garcia recognized the importance of the project, related community feedback, and researching best practices. He suggested that the response to many call types could be removed from the Police Department, including those related to parking enforcement, mental health, and minor crashes. He explained his concerns about sworn officers responding to civil matter standby calls. He described a recent incident involving Tempe Police where an individual drowned and emphasized the importance of utilizing specialized staff to respond to specific issues.

Chairwoman O'Brien asked for additional information on the described role of mental illness in police calls.

Dr. Scott described the process of analyzing call notes to identify potential mental health indicators and suggested that a method be developed to better identify calls with mental health as a contributing factor.

Chairwoman O'Brien asked for clarification on the statistics in the presentation.

Dr. Scott clarified the statistics presented.

Chief Kurtenbach discussed efforts to divert calls related to mental health crises and juvenile behavioral disturbances. He explained next steps in the Police Response to Calls-for-Service Project.

Councilwoman Ansari asked about the timeline to operationalize recommendations.

Chief Kurtenbach noted that the staff and researchers planned to work with City leadership to operationalize recommendations in the next several months.

Ms. Bays indicated staff would seek to provide initial proposals to the subcommittee within the calendar year.

Councilwoman Ansari asked if these proposals would include the creation of new positions, referencing the suggested noise specialist position.

Ms. Bays explained that most recommendations would require adding positions.

Councilwoman Ansari asked if most of the added positions would be in the Neighborhood Services Department.

Ms. Bays noted that this was possible and currently under analysis.

Councilwoman Ansari voiced her excitement for the project and its potential impacts.

Councilman Waring expressed his support for the project and the diversion of calls for juvenile behavioral issues. He asked about the annual number of calls for service.

Chief Kurtenbach discussed the number of calls received and dispatched by the Police Department every year.

Councilman Waring asked for additional clarification on the number of calls dispatched to sworn officers.

Chief Kurtenbach clarified this number.

Councilman Waring asked how the call types presented compared to the total number of calls dispatched.

Chief Kurtenbach described the process of communications staff screening, categorizing, and dispatching calls. He indicated that the call types presented were dispatched calls.

Councilman Waring stated his understanding that the call types presented required either sworn or non-sworn police staff.

Dr. Scott clarified that the call type statistics presented were for calls dispatched to patrol officers.

Councilman Waring stated his understanding of the statistics presented.

Chief Kurtenbach noted that calls dispatched to patrol officers may be adjudicated by non-sworn patrol staff.

Councilman Waring expressed the importance of understanding the proportion of sworn officer responses being discussed. He described the potential impacts of proposed recommendations and suggested that staff expedite changes most impactful to sworn staffing needs, noting that hiring and training staff to implement changes would take time. He voiced his support for the sworn staff survey component of the project.

Councilmember Garcia asked if the number of calls with mental health as a contributing factor could be further studied and better quantified.

Dr. Scott indicated that the study was still in progress and that mental health indicators would be studied more.

Councilmember Garcia suggested a public information campaign to promote the appropriate use of police in response to juvenile behavioral difficulties. He expressed his support for the sworn staff survey and prioritizing Police Officer mental health.

Chairwoman O'Brien requested that staff accelerate efforts to implement recommendations. She emphasized the importance of ensuring the right resources are used to respond to juvenile behavioral disturbances.

## **5. Phoenix Police Department Advanced Less Lethal Response Program**

Assistant City Manager Lori Bays introduced the item.

Assistant Police Chief Bryan Chapman described various components to promote less lethal response by police officers, including policy changes, de-escalation and crisis intervention, additional training models, and previously authorized less lethal tools. He discussed the Advanced Less Lethal Response Program, piloted less lethal tools, community involvement, and program results. He noted examples where the piloted tools were utilized and next steps for program implementation.

Councilmember Garcia expressed his support for reality-based training and asked how other real incidents encountered by police could be used for training.

Chief Chapman described the organized briefing training used by the Police Department

Councilwoman Ansari asked how the results of the City's policy changes compared to the results experienced by other law enforcement agencies.

Chief Chapman indicated that this information was not available, adding that a limited number of law enforcement agencies had adopted similar policy changes.

Councilwoman Ansari asked if there was a third-party organization tracking and comparing agency performance.

Chief Chapman noted that the 8 Can't Wait and Campaign Zero organizations tracked policy reform adoption and that they did not track the results of these policy changes.

Chairwoman O'Brien asked for additional information on the importance of time and distance in police responses.

Chief Chapman explained the value of utilizing time and distance to de-escalate potentially volatile situations, noting that these were emphasized in officer training.

Chairwoman O'Brien indicated that the less lethal tools increased the distance in incident response and asked if they aided in concluding incidents more quickly.

Chief Chapman noted that this varied case-by-case. He described various measures of success being analyzed to evaluate the Advanced Less Lethal Response Program.

Chairwoman O'Brien thanked staff for their efforts and the potential of the program to benefit the community.

### **CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

None.

### **FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

Chairwoman O'Brien expressed her concerns about gun violence in the City and requested an item on reducing gun violence be added to the next agenda. She indicated that Councilmember Garcia had previously requested an update on the recommendations of the Review and Implementation Ad Hoc Committee, noting that Mayor Gallego would be adding this item to a future Policy Session.

Councilmember Garcia asked for an update on the Community Assistance Program and how community members can engage with the program.

Councilwoman Ansari voiced her support for an item on gun violence prevention.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

Chairwoman O'Brien adjourned the meeting at 11:17 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Sara Del Valle  
Management Intern